



## Early Childhood Workforce Policy and Program Scan

The Transforming Colorado's Early Childhood Workforce project is an innovative public-private partnership initiative, which includes Early Milestones Colorado, The Office of Early Learning and School Readiness at the Colorado Department of Education (CDE), and the Office of Early Childhood at the Colorado Department of Human Services (CDHS).

The first phase of this project is to further investigate the issues facing the early childhood workforce by conducting actionable research concerning the individual-, sector-, and policy-level forces shaping the early childhood (EC) workforce sector in order to develop a more stable, equitably-compensated, and appropriately trained high-quality, diverse workforce.

This scan of public programs, policies, and state plans addressed the following questions:

- What are the current federal and state investments in the ECE industry overall and how much do these investments total? What are some local funding mechanisms that also support ECE?
- What are the current public policies and programs that affect ECE workforce recruitment, retention, and compensation in Colorado, including those related to higher education, workforce development, and other public programs?
  - How can these policies be modified to incentivize and help the ECE industry hire and retain a highly qualified and diverse workforce?
  - What new funding possibilities are most likely to win support?
  - How could any new public resources be invested to best support the recruitment and retention of a high quality and diverse ECE workforce?
- What have other states done in relation to ECE workforce recruitment, retention, and compensation?

The scan has been broken down into the following sections:

- Federal and State Investments in ECE in Colorado (Pg. 2)
- Colorado Recruitment, Retention and Compensation Policies and Programs (Pg. 5)
- Examples of Other States' Recruitment, Retention, and Compensation Programs and Policies (Pg. 10)

## Federal and State Investments in ECE in Colorado

Early childhood education and care in Colorado is primarily funded through federal programs and grants, state general fund allocations, local match funding, and philanthropic investments both local and national. Major Federal funding streams include:

- Child Care Development Fund (CCDF): CCDF assists low-income families in obtaining child care so they can work or attend training/education. The program also improves the quality of child care, and promotes coordination among early childhood development and afterschool programs. Colorado received \$73,902,481 in these funds in FY2016.
- Head Start and Early Head Start: Head Start and Early Head Start programs support the comprehensive development of children from birth to age 5, in centers, child care partner locations, and in their own homes. Head Start services include early learning, health, and family well-being. Colorado grantees received \$88,256,495 in these funds in FY2015.
- Early Head Start-Child Care (EHS-CC) Partnerships: EHS-CC grants allow new or existing Early Head Start programs to partner with local child care centers and family child care providers serving infants and toddlers from low-income families. Various entities in Colorado received \$4,500,000 in these funds in FY2015.
- Individuals with Disabilities Education Act (IDEA): IDEA funding goes towards ECE through two mechanisms, IDEA Section 619 Preschool Funding (Special Education Preschool) and IDEA Part C - Grants for Infants and Toddlers (Special Education Early Intervention Services). The Preschool Grants program provides formula grants to states to make available special education and related services for children with disabilities aged 3 through 5. The Grants for Infants and Families program (Part C) awards formula grants to states to assist them in implementing statewide systems of coordinated, comprehensive, multidisciplinary, interagency programs and making early intervention services available to children with disabilities, aged birth through 2, and their families. Colorado received \$4,605,630 in Special Education Preschools funds and \$6,925,712 in Part C in FY2015.
- Maternal, Infant and Early Childhood Home Visiting (MIECHV): MIECHV P gives pregnant women and families, particularly those considered at-risk, necessary resources and skills to raise children healthy and ready to learn. From birth to kindergarten entry, MIECHV funds states, territories, and tribal entities to develop and implement evidence-based, voluntary programs that best meet the needs of their communities. Colorado received \$9,951,443 in these funds in FY2015.
- Race to the Top Early Learning Challenge Grant: The RTT-ELC grant competition focused on improving early learning and development programs for young children by supporting States' efforts to increase the number and percentage of low-income and disadvantaged children in each age group of infants, toddlers, and preschoolers who are enrolled in high-quality early learning programs; design and implement an integrated system of high-quality early learning programs and services; and ensure that any use of assessments conforms with the recommendations of the National Research Council's reports on early childhood. Colorado received \$44,888,832 in grant awards between FY2012 and FY2013.
- Child and Adult Care Food Program (CACFP): This program provides aid to child and adult care institutions and family or group day care homes for the provision of nutritious foods that contribute to the wellness, healthy growth, and development of young children, and the health and wellness of older adults and chronically impaired disabled persons. Colorado received \$24,628,468 in these funds in FY2016.
- 21st Century Community Learning Centers (21stCCLC): This program supports the creation of community learning centers that provide academic enrichment opportunities during non-school hours for children, particularly students who attend high-poverty and low-performing schools. Colorado received \$11,925,141 in these funds in FY2015.

Additional federal supports exist that provide funding to the early years overall, such as Women, Infants, and Children (WIC), Temporary Assistance for Needy Families (TANF), and Children's Health Insurance Program (CHIP) which are included in the longer report.

Major state funding streams include:

- Colorado Child Care Assistance Program (CCCAP): CCCAP provides financial assistance to low-income families who are working, searching for employment and/or training that are enrolled in the Colorado Works Program and need child care services to support their efforts toward self-sufficiency. Total funding for this program, including federal, state and local contributions, is \$89,593,241 for FY2016-2017.
- Colorado Preschool Program: The Colorado Preschool Program (CPP) is a state-funded early childhood education program administered by the Colorado Department of Education. Children must be 3, 4 or 5 years old and have eligibility factor(s) present in their lives. Total funding for the program is \$102,189,794 for FY2017-2017.
- Hold Harmless Kindergarten Funding: This line item provides funding to school districts for students enrolled in full-day kindergarten. Total funding of this program is \$7,922,486 for FY2016-2017.
- Child Care Grants for Quality and Availability and Federal Targeted Funds: The two components of the line item appropriation are the federal requirements that four percent of expenditures for Child Care and Development Fund (CCDF) be used to improve the quality of child care and four percent of the CCDF discretionary grant be targeted for infant/toddler care, child care resource and referral and school-age child care activities, or quality expansion activities such as professional development, mentoring, provider retention, equipment supply, facility start-up, and minor facility renovation. Total funding for this line item, including federal and state contributions, is \$8,671,947 for FY2016-2017.
- Child Care Licensing: This line item appropriation funds the personnel and operating costs associated with child care licensing and administrative activities. Total funding for this line item, including federal and state contributions, is \$7,959,729 for FY2016-2017.
- Early Intervention: Early Intervention services provide infants and toddlers from birth through age two who are determined eligible based on a developmental delay or disability, and their families, with services and supports to enhance child development in the areas of cognition, speech, communication, physical development, motor development, vision, hearing, social and emotional development, self-help skills; early identification, screening and assessment services, and procedural safeguards. Total funding for this program, including federal, state and local contributions, is \$43,981,037 in FY2016-2017.
- Early Childhood Mental Health Services: The purpose of the Early Childhood Mental Health Specialist (ECMHS) program is to increase the availability of mental health services to young children, birth through 5 and provide consultation and coaching/training to families and early learning programs. Total funding for this program, including federal and state contributions, is \$2,944,683 in FY2016-2017.
- Early Childhood Councils: ECCs are charged with building the foundations of a locally based early childhood system so that more high quality services are available to more children and families, including aligning health, mental health, family support, and early childhood education services. Total funding for this program is \$1,984,169 for FY2016-2017, though all of the funds are federal.
- Early Literacy Funding: When a district identifies a student with significant reading deficiencies, the Act defines the process to develop a Reading to Ensure Academic Development (READ) Plan. This funding is given on a per pupil basis to students identified with significant reading deficiencies. Total funding for this program is \$33,242,424 for FY2016-2017.
- Nurse Home Visitor Program: The Nurse Home Visitor provides funding for regular in-home visiting nurse services to low-income, first-time mothers with their consent, during their pregnancies and through their children's second birthday. The program is designed to provide trained visiting nurses to help educate mothers

on the importance of nutrition and avoiding alcohol and drugs, including nicotine, and to assist and educate mothers in providing general infant care to improve health outcomes for their children. Total funding for this program is \$16,638,977 for FY2016-2017.

- Preschool to Postsecondary Alignment: This line item supports aligning education standards and assessments from preschool through postsecondary and workforce readiness and the adoption of assessments that are aligned with the school readiness description. Total funding for this program is \$630,153 for FY2016-2017.
- School-readiness Quality Improvement Program: The School-Readiness Child Care Subsidization Program was created to improve the quality of licensed child care facilities whose enrolled children ultimately attend elementary schools that are required to implement a priority improvement or turnaround plan. Total funding for this program is \$2,229,652 for FY2016-2017, though all funds are federal.
- Tony Grampas Youth Services Program: The Tony Grampas Youth Services Program (TGYS) is a program to provide funding to community-based organizations that serve children, youth, and their families with programs designed to reduce youth crime and violence and prevent child abuse and neglect, including early childhood programs. Total funding for this program is \$8,960,220 for FY2016-2017.

Possible considerations of the federal and state investments in early childhood education and care in Colorado include:

- Is the amount of federal funding sustainable compared to state funding?
- Should we consider applying for untapped federal funds such as Promise Neighborhoods and the Preschool Development Grants?
- How can current funding streams, like ESEA/ESSA be redirected to early education?
- How can we encourage more state level investments beyond required federal matches?
- Can we scale up current pilot programs, like micro loans and grants, preschool to postsecondary alignment, and school readiness quality improvement?

## Colorado Recruitment, Retention and Compensation Policies and Programs

Colorado has a variety of public policies and programs that affect the recruitment, retention, and compensation of the ECE workforce. Most commonly, the Colorado Department of Education and the Colorado Department of Human Services acts as the oversight authority for these policies.

### Recruitment Policies:

The bulk of recruitment policies in Colorado are related to child care licensing. Licensing encompasses the requirements for ECE teachers, directors and other staff in following areas:

- Education and general qualifications
- Training and continuing education requirements
- Background checks and health/immunization records
- Personnel policies
- Group Size and Ratios
- Program and staff requirements in working with certain age groups
- Waivers and appeals

Colorado also has Early Learning Professional Development System Plan which lays out the competencies for early childhood educators and administrators. The Colorado Coaching Consortium houses coaching competencies and credentialing.

In relation to higher education and recruitment of the ECE workforce, the primary policies and programs are as follows:

- Colorado Community College Foundation Scholarships: The Colorado Department of Education worked with the Colorado Community College Foundation to expand access and increase the number of participating students. Administered through community colleges across the state, scholarships are available to students for coursework leading to certification or an AA degree.
- Early Intervention and Preschool Special Education Scholarships: Like many states, Colorado is experiencing difficulty in recruiting and retaining personnel to serve young children with disabilities and their families who are enrolled in Early Intervention and Preschool Special Education. CDE's Preschool Special Education staff and CDHS's Early Intervention staff worked with school districts and community boards in Colorado to identify gaps in supporting professionals working in programs serving children with special needs. Areas of established need were identified through surveys of local programs.
- Early Childhood Teacher Education Transfer Agreement Between Colorado Public Community/Junior Colleges: The purpose of a statewide articulation agreement is to identify the courses a student at a Colorado public community college must complete as part of an AA/AS degree to be guaranteed to be able to complete the designated baccalaureate degree program at any public four-year college and that offers that program within the minimum number of credits designated by the Colorado Commission on Higher Education.
- T.E.A.C.H. Scholarships: T.E.A.C.H. Early Childhood® program provides college scholarships to early care and education professionals. T.E.A.C.H., which is affiliated with the national Teacher Education and Compensation Helps initiative, pays for 90 percent of the college tuition and fees for college classes to meet licensing requirements and to earn a credential, associate or bachelor's degree. With each T.E.A.C.H scholarship, recipients receive counseling and support services, a completion bonus and reimbursement for travel, textbooks, internet bills and unpaid time off from work

Possible considerations of how to modify current policies or invest in new policies and programs includes:

- How can the licensing system be streamlined in requirements?
- Does more communication or navigators need to be put in place to help ECE workers navigate requirements?

- What tweaks to modernize background checks, such as pay online options for TRAILS, are feasible?
- What opportunities exist for more partnership between ECE and higher education, particularly at four year universities?
- What other possible scholarship or loan forgiveness programs could be possible, either through existing funding streams like CCDF or new possible federal and state investments?
- What partnerships between ECE and K-12 would allow for more shared resources and less duplication or requirements?
- Can Colorado prioritize ECE recruitment in workforce policies such as the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA)?

### Retention Policies:

Retention policies and programs in Colorado focus on both larger system building efforts, as well as small programs and initiatives to improve retention of the ECE workforce.

Two large systems that support ECE workforce retention in Colorado is Colorado Shines and the Professional Development Information System (PDIS), both supported by Colorado's Race to the Top Early Learning Challenge Grant. Colorado Shines encourages and supports programs to improve their quality and to connect with families looking for quality care for their children. The Professional Development Information System (PDIS) is the statewide web-based system supporting professional development for Colorado's early childhood workforce. The system was developed with Colorado's Competencies for Early Childhood Educators and Administrators as the foundation and all professional development offerings within the system will align with these competencies. Both systems encourage continuous training and professional development to improve quality in programs. Local coaching models that emphasize in classroom coaching and professional development can also support continuous quality improvement and ECE workforce retention.

Early Childhood Councils are also an important tool in ECE workforce retention. ECCs are charged with building the foundations of a locally based early childhood system so that more high quality services are available to more children and families. The Early Childhood Councils aim to integrate early childhood services across four early childhood domains – health, mental health, family support, and early care and education – in order to maximize the effectiveness of local services to children and create a sustainable, long-term investment in improving the quality of those services for children and families. Additionally, Early Childhood Councils must each meet specific, defined expectations for building their local early childhood systems; e.g., organizational structure, representation, governance, strategic planning. This type of infrastructure can better support local ECE worker force communities.

The Early Childhood Leadership Commission and its subcommittees also serve to increase ECE workforce retention through advocacy and system building efforts. The Early Childhood Leadership Commission (ECLC) is Colorado's state advisory council for early childhood. The role of the ECLC is to be a statewide leader, subject matter expert and champion of best and promising practices throughout the state. The legislative interim committee that studies early childhood issues with public feedback and engagement to create policies, the Early Childhood School Readiness Legislative Commission, can also impact ECE retention policies and programs.

Other supports that can affect teacher retention exist, such as Early Childhood Mental Health Specialists or Family Support Programs. Though these policies and programs may not appear to directly impact the ECE workforce, these support policies give the workforce greater resources for the children and families they serve, which helps ECE workers focus on their jobs and can help prevent burnout and eventual turnover.

The Early Childhood Colorado Framework and Early Learning Development Guidelines also provide opportunities for systems coordination to better improve the function and quality of ECE programs, setting the stage for a more defined and stable workforce.

Other programs and grants that can improve ECE workforce retention include:

- **School Readiness Quality Improvement Program:** The School-Readiness Child Care Subsidization Program aims to improve the quality of licensed child care facilities whose enrolled children ultimately attend elementary schools that are required to implement a priority improvement or turnaround plan. Local Early Childhood Councils develop plans to engage young children, providers, schools, families and communities.
- **Expanding Quality in Infant Toddler Care Initiative:** The Expanding Quality in Infant Toddler Care (EQ) Initiative is a collaboration between the Colorado Department of Education and the Colorado Department of Human Services with the primary goal to increase the quality and availability of responsive care for infants and toddlers throughout Colorado. The initiative focuses on:
  - Strengthening the skills and knowledge base of Early Childhood professionals working with infants and toddlers
  - Building capacity and promoting systemic change to foster increased quality and availability of care and services
  - Supporting leadership and collaboration at the community level
  - Facilitating professional development for infant toddler professionals, particularly those who are teaching or coaching infant toddler teachers
- **Preschool to Postsecondary Alignment:** This line item supports aligning education standards and assessments from preschool through postsecondary and workforce readiness and the adoption of assessments that are aligned with the school readiness description.
- **Coaching:** Led by the Colorado Coaching Consortium, in classroom coaching models are used throughout the state to improve instruction.

Some in classroom tools are used in Colorado to aid in retention, such as the CLASS Tool and Results Matter. The CLASS tool is an observation instrument developed to assess classroom quality in preschool through third grade classrooms. The tool looks at interactions between students and adults as the primary mechanism of student development and learning. CLASS is included as a course in PDIS. The Results Matter program improves outcomes for Colorado's youngest children by helping teachers, administrators, families, and other education stakeholders use authentic assessment data to inform classroom instruction as well as program and policy decision making. Both provide additional data and information to ECE teachers and directors to improve their classrooms and instruction methods through feedback and coaching.

Also worth noting is the Buell Early Childhood Leadership Program. The Buell Program (BECLP) is an 18 credit, year-long graduate certificate offered in partnership with the University of Colorado Denver's School of Education and Human Development and Clayton Early Learning with generous support from the Buell Foundation. The goal of this program is to support existing and emerging leaders in the field of early care and education to become effective agents for change, aligning values, voice, and actions to create equity, opportunity, and educational excellence for all young children and families in Colorado.

Possible considerations of how to modify current policy or invest in new policies or programs includes:

- How can we sustain the momentum of Colorado Shines and the PDIS post-Race to the Top?
- How can we further incentive programs and staff to engage with Colorado Shines and improve their rating?
- What supports can be put into place to help with classroom coverage to allow for more professional development and coaching opportunities for teachers and directors?
- What general business and operational support can be given to directors?

- How can the data systems used for tools like CLASS and Results Matter be more effective and easy to use?
- Can public investments be directed to in classroom tools?
- What other funding streams exist to support the sustainability of Early Childhood Councils?
- Can initiatives like School Readiness Quality Improvement Program and the Preschool to Postsecondary Alignment be expanded?
- How can groups like the ECLC and the ECSRLC better align in their efforts to support ECE workforce retention?
- How can additional supports like family resources and mental health be expanded to further support the ECE workforce? And how can these supports be available to the ECE workforce members themselves?
- What other programs like the Buell Early Childhood Leadership program can be created in public-private partnerships with higher education, the business community, etc.?
- How can we create career ladders and advancement opportunities for ECE teachers and directors?

#### Compensation Policies:

Compensation policies and programs in Colorado are primarily tax credits, funds available within larger funding streams, and pilot programs.

The tax credits available to support ECE and the ECE workforce in Colorado include:

- Child Care Contribution Tax Credit: CCTC enables individual and business taxpayers that make a monetary contribution to promote child care and early education in Colorado to claim a state income tax credit of 50% of the total qualifying contribution.
- Child Care Expenses Tax Credit: Colorado families that earn less than \$60,000 are eligible for the Colorado Child Care Credit, which is worth a percentage of the federal Child and Dependent Care Tax Credit.
- Earned Income Tax Credit: The Earned Income Tax Credit (EITC) is a refundable tax credit from the Internal Revenue Service (IRS) that helps boost the incomes of low-wage, working families... Low- to moderate-income workers can claim a Colorado state EITC starting in 2016. Colorado's state EITC will be worth 10 percent of the federal EITC, providing low-wage earners with an even larger refund at tax time.
- Enterprise Zone Tax Credits: Colorado taxpayers may earn Colorado income tax credits by contributing to targeted efforts. Training for child care providers, creation of new child care centers, and dissemination of child care services and information is an eligible contribution.

Larger funding streams that can positively impact compensation have been explored elsewhere in this document, and include the Colorado Preschool Program, Head Start, School Readiness Quality Improvement Program and the Colorado Child Care Assistance Program.

Smaller pilot programs and initiatives worth noting include:

- Pay for Success Contracts: This new funding mechanism allows the state to leverage private and philanthropic dollars to fund social programs that only get repaid by the government if certain agreed upon outcomes are achieved
- Micro Loans to Increase Access to Child Care: The program encourages unlicensed home-based providers to become licensed child care providers and is funded by the federal CCDF. The loans of up \$10,000 are intended to pay for the costs of licensing expenditures, physical equipment, and additional training and coaching costs
- Micro Grants to Increase Access to Child Care: The Micro Grants to Increase Access to Child Care line item, funded by federal CCDF, provides funding that can be distributed as micro grants to licensed child care providers to expand access by increasing capacity and purchasing basic materials needed in licensed facilities.

Another policy that could positively benefit ECE workforce compensation is the Market Rate Study conducted for the Colorado Child Care Assistance Program (CCCAP). This market rate survey is used to establish State suggested rates for

CCCAP that provide “equal access” to children and families, generally defined as rates at the 75th percentile of a given child care market. All Colorado counties are now required to have tiered reimbursement for providers based on quality, which could affect compensation levels.

Possible considerations of how to modify current policy or invest in new policies or programs includes:

- Are the current tax credits effective? If not, why and how can they be modified?
- What types of additional tax credits would aid the compensation of the ECE workforce?
- How can Colorado tap into other funding streams, like the Every Students Succeeds Act, to positively impact ECE workforce compensation?
- What other kinds of QRIS tied incentives can be created to encourage programs and staff to engage with Colorado Shines and improve their rating?
- Are there any places in our current funding streams that could be reallocated to support compensation?
- How can we scale up smaller programs like Pay for Success and micro loans?
- Beyond strictly monetary compensation, what other types of benefits can be offered to incentivize the ECE workforce, such as health benefits, loan forgiveness, etc.?

## Examples of Other States' Recruitment, Retention, and Compensation Programs and Policies

When looking at what potential policies and program strategies Colorado may want to invest in to promote the recruitment, retention, and compensation of a highly qualified early childhood workforce, other state's strategies are important to consider.

### Recruitment Policies:

The primary focus of other states' recruitment policies is on educational counseling and scholarships for ECE workers.

States like Massachusetts and Georgia provide initial academic advising and informal educational counseling to anyone interested in pursuing a degree in the ECE field, including navigating the financial aid process.

Scholarships for the ECE workforce vary state by state, and are often attached to the QRIS system or credentialing system in the state. Additional requirements for scholarships include state residency, having applied for financial aid through the standard Free Application for Federal Student Aid (FAFSA), and previous ECE employment. Massachusetts also has the requirement that students have a signed agreement in place to continue employment as an early childhood educator upon completing the degree requirement, otherwise they will need to repay the scholarship funds. Maine has GPA requirements for students receiving scholarships. The Child Development Associate Credential is often included in the list of eligible degrees and credentials that would qualify for financial assistance or scholarships. Application fees are also included in assistance packages in states like Georgia.

Illinois has a loan repayment program for teachers and child care providers that choose to teach in low income areas after receiving their degree.

Additionally, the California Early Childhood Mentor Program provides resources and support to aspiring and experienced teachers and administrators in programs serving children birth to five and before- and after-school programs.

There are opportunities for states within the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA), both for ECE workforce recruitment and retention that could be explored. According to the Aspen Institute, "Organizations can also work with state and local leaders to ensure two-generation strategies are infused into new workforce programs by highlighting the critical connection between what happens with a young person in a training program and what happens with their children."

### Retention Policies:

Retention policies in other states tend to focus professional development tools both in and out of the classroom.

Some tools are scalable and active in several states. These tools include:

- **SEQUAL:** The SEQUAL is a multi-purpose tool for examining and improving environments in which early childhood teaching staff work and learn. The SEQUAL assesses how well the workplace supports teaching staff to learn and to continue to develop their knowledge and skills on the job. It is administered directly to teachers and assistant teachers in centers or school-based programs.
- **Child Development Credential:** The Child Development Associate (CDA) Credential™ is a widely recognized credential in early childhood education administered by the Council for Professional Development. The CDA Credential guides early child care professionals as they work toward becoming qualified teachers of young children.
- **Program Administration Scale:** The Program Administration Scale is a tool for Center and School Based Program Administrators to assess the program's administrative practices. In this training, participants will review the elements of the Program Administration Scale, practice completing the assessment including scoring, and

explore strategies for program improvements. This will help educators use the tool to increase responsive interactions with children and improve the overall program environment

- **New Teacher Center:** New Teacher Center's proven teacher induction model is a program of weekly on-the-job mentoring for new teachers from an accomplished, well-prepared peer. It results in remarkably effective new teachers, increased overall teacher retention, improved student achievement and reduced district teacher recruiting costs.

Other notable programs include the Workforce Competitiveness Trust Fund invests in training and education programs that train unemployed and underemployed workers for jobs that are in demand, including in ECE, in Massachusetts. Also the McCormick Center in Illinois which serves as a voice for the early childhood workforce by advocating for better working conditions and compensation, supporting emerging leaders from under-represented groups, and strengthening professional standards. The activities of the McCormick Center include professional development, evaluation to measure and improve the quality of early learning programs, research to enhance the knowledge base on key workforce and professional development issues, and public awareness campaigns.

It should be noted that many recruitment and compensation strategies listed in other sections of this report can be utilized as retention strategies as well, i.e. scholarships to encourage continued education or ESSA professional development.

#### Compensation Policies:

Other states face the same budgetary restraints when it comes to compensation policies and programs as Colorado does. Many wage supplement programs, such as C-WAGES in California, are funded by temporary federal government initiatives like the Race to the Top Early Learning Challenge Grant or CCDF quality funds. The majority of wage supplement programs do have income requirements as well as educational requirements, and many also take tenure and QRIS ratings of programs into account. States like Pennsylvania, Wisconsin, and Georgia offer wage supplements or awards to ECE teachers, directors, and family home workers.

Tax credits are also used in several states to help boost ECE worker compensation. Though Colorado has a contribution tax credit and a child care expenses tax credit, other states like Louisiana and Nebraska have tax credits that are specifically for ECE workers.

Pay parity with K-12 teachers exists in seventeen states which require lead teachers teaching in state pre-K programs to be paid at the same rate as elementary school teachers. Georgia, Missouri, Oklahoma and Tennessee require salary parity for pre-K teachers across all settings, both public and nonpublic. These requirements apply only to state-funded pre-K programs. Massachusetts had additional funds available for ECE salaries through its universal pre-kindergarten program pilot.

Other compensation strategies include unions for the ECE workforce, grassroots campaigns to inform ECE workers of health and other benefits they are eligible for, and resources and training from national organizations such as Center for the Childcare Workforce.

It's worth noting the additional funding opportunities that are available through the Every Student Succeeds Act (ESSEA). Though ESSA does not explicitly direct new funds into ECE programs in states, it more clearly describes within the titles opportunities to support early childhood in the education system. The U.S. Department of Education released additional guidance to states on how to improve the funding and infrastructure of early learning through ESSA, which includes:

- **Title I:** Title I of ESEA allows LEAs to provide preschool programs to improve educational outcomes for eligible children. Each LEA receiving Title I funds, regardless of whether it operates a Title I preschool program, must develop agreements and carry out the following coordination activities with Head Start and if possible other

early childhood programs. Title I funds may also be used to support ongoing professional development for preschool teachers within certain requirements.

- Title II: Title II, Part A funds may be used to support the professional development of early educators, including joint professional development with K-12 programs and more transition planning. Title II funds can also be used for early literacy efforts.
- Title III: SEAs that receive Title III funds and LEAs that receive Title III sub grants may use these funds to provide professional development for early childhood educators who teach ELs ages 3 and up. Title III funds may be used for professional development to improve the skills and knowledge of teachers of ELs, including preschool teachers and school leaders
- Title IV: Title IV, Part X of the ESEA provides continued opportunities to serve preschool children through the Charter Schools Program (CSP), which is aimed at expanding the number of high-quality charter schools available to students across the nation.
- Additional opportunities through programs for special populations including children who are experiencing homelessness, migratory children, and English learners.